Strategies and Tactics for Recruiting to Improve Diversity and Excellence

Jackie Isaacs, Professor of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering, Chair
Jack Dennerlein, Professor of Physical Therapy
Judith Hall, University Distinguished Professor of Psychology
Carla Mattos, Professor of Chemistry and Chemical Biology
Marjorie Platt, Professor of Accounting
Mark Williams, Professor of Physics

Jan Rinehart, Executive Director ADVANCE Office of Faculty Development
Kathleen Kenney, Assistant Director ADVANCE Office of Faculty Development

Previous STRIDE members: George Adams, Mechanical & Industrial Engr.; Dana Brooks, Electrical & Computer Engr.; Agnes Chan, Computer and Information Sciences; Barry Chung, Counseling and Applied Educational Psychology; Max Diem, Chemistry and Chemical Biology; Luis Falcon, Sociology and Anthropology; Craig Ferris, Professor Psychology; Miriam Leeser, Professor Electrical and Computer Engineering; Ineke Marshall, Sociology and Anthropology, Criminal Justice; Ramiro Martinez, Professor Criminology and Criminal Justice; Sanjeev Mukerjee, Chemistry and Chemical Biology; Rajmohan Rajaraman, Professor Computer and Information Sciences; Kathrin Zippel, Sociology and Anthropology

Northeastern University
ADVANCE Office of Faculty Development
The Goal of today’s STRIDE Workshop

Participants will learn…

• Good practices for search committees
• How diversity provides excellence in our community
• Search Committees are made of humans with unconscious associations that may lead to implicit bias
Overview of Presentation

• Introduction
  – Why recruit for diversity and excellence?
  – Stages of a faculty search
• *Activity*: Highest risk for bias and debrief (15 min.)
• Research on implicit bias (10 min.)
• *Activity*: Effective practices and debrief (25 min.)
• Neutralizing implicit bias
• Evaluation
Diversity Brings Excellence to Our Campus

- Valuable part of the Northeastern’s mission: Long Range Plan
- Diversity benefits everyone: more points of view & diverse approaches to research and teaching
  - Some early voice-recognition systems were calibrated to typical male voices. As a result, women's voices were literally unheard
  - The first generation of automotive airbags were designed to fit adult male bodies, resulting in avoidable deaths for women and children
- Diversity is a key driver for creativity and innovation
- Brings a greater number of valuable and talented candidates to campus (broadens the candidate pool)

Diversity Brings Excellence to Our Campus

- Ensures diverse faculty to educate a more diverse group of students, including women and minority role models
- More diverse groups make more informed decisions
- Companies in the top quartile for women in the executive committee from 2007–2009 had 41% greater return on equity, and 56% greater earnings before interest and taxes than companies with no women in the executive committee
- Organizations with greater racial diversity were associated with greater sales revenue, a larger number of customers, greater market share, and greater profits

Is It Reverse Discrimination to Recruit for Diversity?

- It is legal to expand applicant pool by adding diverse candidates
- Goal is to increase diversity of faculty by increasing diversity of highly qualified pool
- Northeastern fully complies with federal and state laws: Law prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, ethnicity, national origin, gender, age (>40), sexual orientation, religion, genetic information
The % of women in the T&TT faculty has increased from 31% in 2009 to 34% in 2016.

From 2009-2016, the % of T&TT men who are URM has stayed flat at 6%. The % of T&TT women who are URM has decreased from 14% to 12%.

We have been hiring 35-45% women for T&TT positions over the past 7 years.
Schemas and Faculty Searches
Schemas are…

• **Schemas** are automatic patterns of thoughts that organize our social information and assumptions.
  – Reduce the amount of info to process
  – Reduce ambiguity
  – Allow people to act without effort
  – Make decisions faster, easier → **We keep using them**

• Well-developed schemas, such as those about gender, can be difficult to change even in light of new information.

• **Widely culturally shared**
  – Both men and women hold them about gender
  – Both whites and people of color hold them about race/ethnicity
  – People are often not aware of them

Unintended Consequences of Schemas

• **Applied more** under circumstances of:
  – Ambiguity (including lack of information)
  – Stress from competing tasks
  – Time pressure
  – Lack of critical mass

• *Research shows that we all perceive and treat people based on our schemas about their social groups (race/ethnicity, economic and social status, gender, sexual orientation, disability, academic institution, etc.).*

• It is tempting to believe that discrimination of some groups is a thing of the past, but nonconsciously applying schemas may result in bias

Testing for Unconscious Associations

"Your data suggest a moderate association of Male with Science and Female with Liberal Arts compared to Female with Science and Male with Liberal Arts."

Thank you for your participation. Just below is a breakdown of the scores generated by others. Most respondents find it easier to associate Male with Science and Female with Liberal Arts compared to the reverse.

Many of the questions that you answered on the previous page have been addressed in research over the last 10 years. For example, the order that you performed the response pairing is influential, but procedural corrections largely eliminate that influence (see FAQ #1). Each visitor to the site completes the task in a randomized order. If you would like to learn more

Implicit Association Test: [https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/]
Five Stages of a Faculty Search

A. Define criteria and qualities required for position
B. Actively recruit a diverse pool and develop strategies about senior faculty hiring
C. Review and identify the long/short list
D. Conduct an effective on campus interview
E. Recommend finalist(s) to Chair
Exercise 1: Identify Challenges

- Decide what stage your group believes is most “at risk” of schemas that would negatively impact the outcome of the search (5 minutes)

- Debrief with the larger group (10 minutes)
Five Stages of a Faculty Search

A. Define criteria and qualities required for position
B. Actively recruit a diverse pool, and develop strategies for senior faculty hiring
C. Review and identify the long/short list
D. Conduct an effective on campus interview
E. Recommend finalist(s) to Chair
Research on Implicit Bias
Bias in Evaluation of CVs

When evaluating applications for a lab manager...
...male and female science faculty rated men more competent and hire-able than identical female applicants and offered higher salaries to the men.

A meta analysis of 111 studies showed...
Men were rated more favorably than women for male-dominated jobs.
No strong preference for either gender for female-dominated and integrated jobs.
Gender bias was reduced when information clearly indicated high competence during evaluation.

A MIT study...
Applicants with African-American-sounding names received 50% fewer call-backs than applicants with white-sounding names.

Moss-Racusin, C.S., Dovidio, J.F. et. al. (2012). Science Faculty’s Subtle Gender Bias Favor Male Students. PNAS, 109, 41.
Recommendation Letters for Faculty Applicants

Letters for men:
- More agentic descriptors – ambitious, dominant, self-confident
- More references to...
  - CV
  - Publications
  - Colleagues

Letters for women:
- More communal descriptors – affectionate, warm, kind, nurturing
- More references to personal life
- More comments that raise doubts:
  - “It’s amazing how much she’s accomplished.”
  - “It appears her health is stable.”
  - “She is close to my wife.”
- May reveal protected status, ie. marital status, children, etc.
  - “She has overcome so much as a single mother with 2 kids.”

Communal characteristics have a negative relationship with hiring decisions in academia

Impact of Schemas about Mothers

• Equally qualified men and women evaluated…
  – Mothers rated less competent
  – Mothers received half as many call backs as men
  – Fathers advantaged over childless men

• In a 2007 study, the recommended salary for female job applicants was 7.4% lower for mothers vs. childless women

• However, women academics who marry and have families publish as many articles per year as single women

Ethnicity is a Significant Factor in Grant Evaluations, 2011

• Analysis of 80,000 NIH grant applications (2000-06) found that 16% submitted by black applicants were approved, compared to 29% for white applicants

• When all other factors were held constant, black applicants were significantly less likely to get funding due to their race

• Factors for the significant differences include:
  • Bias in peer-review process
  • Black scientists lack professional networks and mentoring

• Results point to subtle and unintentional yet systematic forms of discrimination

Stein, R. (2011). Blacks less likely than whites to get NIH grants, NIH study
Blind Auditions

When musicians auditioned behind a blind screen...

…the proportion of females hired for orchestral jobs increased significantly

Double-blind review of journal papers significantly increases female publications


Exercise 2: Brainstorm Strategies

• Brainstorm effective practices for avoiding implicit bias for a search stage (10 minutes)

• Debrief with the larger group (15 minutes)
  – What are two things you will do during your next faculty search?
Five Stages of a Faculty Search

A. Define criteria and qualities required for position
B. Actively recruit a diverse pool, and develop strategies for senior faculty hiring
C. Review and identify the long/short list
D. Conduct an effective on campus interview
E. Recommend finalist(s) to Chair
What Can We Do?
Stage A: Define Criteria and Qualities Required for the Position

• Within the search committee discuss words such as ‘fit’, ‘excellence’, ‘quality’
• Write the ad using broad research area
• Discuss diversity and its meaning to the dept.
• Develop a matrix for initial review and final ranking
• Have a meeting to discuss how your committee will evaluate the applicants – don’t use your ‘gut’
Sample of Pre-campus Evaluation Tool

Please rate the candidate on each of the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>excellent</th>
<th>good</th>
<th>neutral</th>
<th>fair</th>
<th>poor</th>
<th>unable to judge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fit with department’s priorities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of scholarly impact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of research productivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of research funding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of collaboration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to make positive contribution to department’s climate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to attract and supervise graduate students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to teach and supervise undergraduates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please comment on the candidate’s research program:

Please comment on the candidate’s expertise:

Other Comments:

*Matrix adapted from work by Changiz Mohiyeddini, Northeastern Associate Professor of Counseling and Applied Psychology
Stage B: Actively Recruit a Diverse Pool…

- Develop a departmental strategy for year-round strategic recruiting
- *Know the number of women and minorities receiving PhDs in your discipline
- Build relationships with diverse scholars at national conferences
-Broaden institutions from which you recruit and collaborate
- Send the ad to national women and minority organizations, committees, and caucuses in your discipline
- Search prestigious fellowship holders including minority fellowships
- Recruit a Future Faculty Fellow
- *Host a Future Faculty Workshop with a conference

*ADVANCE can help your search committee with these items

www.northeastern.edu/advance
Stage B. …and Develop Strategies for Recruiting of Senior Faculty

- Go beyond your own network – beyond the people you know
- Don’t assume people are not moveable
- Ask ADVANCE if they have resources for your discipline
- Explore databases of funded awards for diverse candidates
  - NSF Awards Search (http://nsf.gov/awardsearch/)
  - Web of Science database (available on the library website)
  - Resource Guide (northeastern.edu/advance/recruitment/)
  - National Academies directories
- Look at who held leadership positions in national organizations
Stage C: Review and Identify the Short List

- Agree on objective criteria and apply consistently, use evaluation matrix
- Completely review all applications
- Remember gender schemas (women rated lower than men)
- Remember ethnic names receive fewer call backs
- Consider letter writer and reader biases
  - Tom Forth’s online Gender Bias calculator
- Avoid bias for women with children
- Consider PhD/postdocs from schools other than the top
Stage D: Conduct an Effective On-Campus Interview

- Value each candidate as a unique individual, not as a token
- Aim for diverse and welcoming audiences when scheduling meetings – for all candidates
- Ask if there are individuals or groups the candidate wants to meet while on campus
- Create a list of questions to allow comparison of common factors for each candidate
- Read candidate CV before you meet with them
- Do not ask illegal questions or use this information in committee deliberations
Federal / state laws and regulations prohibit questions about these classes to protect them:

- Family status
- Race
- Religion
- Gender
- Age
- Arrests
- Citizenship or nationality
- Disability
- Sexual Orientation
- Pregnancy

Because organizations have made hiring decisions based on these criteria instead of hiring the ‘best’ candidate

Northeastern Provost’s Guide for Conducting Interviews:
http://www.northeastern.edu/provost/resources/faculty/
Stage D: On-Campus…
Examples of Illegal Questions: Family Status

Illegal Questions:
- Are you married?
- Are you planning to start a family?
- What is your spouse's name?
- What is your maiden name?
- Do you have any children?
- Are you pregnant?
- What are your childcare arrangements?

Asking any of these questions is:
Illegal and counter-productive (reflects poorly on the university and candidates might resent questions)

Even if you know some of this protected information, do not discuss it in search committee deliberations – your goal is to hire the BEST candidate based on the job description
Unique Challenges for Recruiting LGBTQ Faculty

- Same-sex marriage is legal and Massachusetts includes adoption rights; Northeastern provides health care coverage for all married couples as well as same sex spousal equivalents.

- LGBTQ individuals may sponsor their partners for immigration purposes if they are legally married, meaning they were married lawfully in a jurisdiction that recognizes their marriage. Same-sex couples married in Massachusetts will meet this standard.
Stage E: Recommend Finalist(s) to Chair

- Complete evaluation matrix for each candidate within 24 hours
- Use consistent objective criteria in evaluation of every candidate
- Remember letter writer and reader biases
- Do not use protected class information in any discussion about ranking or hiring
- Be mindful of committee group dynamics
Faculty Search Resources

- STRIDE slides [http://www.northeastern.edu/advance/recruitment/stride-faculty-search-committee-workshop/](http://www.northeastern.edu/advance/recruitment/stride-faculty-search-committee-workshop/)

- VPAA Resources – Faculty Hiring
  [http://www.northeastern.edu/provost/resources/faculty/](http://www.northeastern.edu/provost/resources/faculty/)
  - University Search Guide
  - Guidance for Conducting Interviews – including what not to ask
  - Candidate Visit Information

- ADVANCE Resources - NU and External
  [http://www.northeastern.edu/advance/resources/](http://www.northeastern.edu/advance/resources/)
  - Sample Faculty Candidate Review Matrix
  - Links to find Ph.D degrees granted by discipline
  - Candidate institutional information
  - Partner placement information
Thank you!

**GOAL:** Raise awareness and educate the university community about concerns and best practices for diversity and excellence in hiring and evaluation processes.

What questions and comments do you have?

Please take 5 minutes and complete the STRIDE Workshop Evaluation in your packet.
THANK YOU!